

Evaluation of the Potential for Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy in the United States

Joshua T. Cohen
Keith Duggar
George M. Gray
Silvia Kreindel

Harvard Center for Risk Analysis
Harvard School of Public Health

Hatim Abdelrahman
Tsegaye HabteMariam
David Oryang
Berhanu Tameru

Center for Computational Epidemiology
College of Veterinary Medicine
Tuskegee University

November 26, 2001

Acknowledgments

This project benefited from information and advice from many individuals. Any errors or misstatements are due to the authors, not the many contributors.

The authors gratefully acknowledge Nathan E. Bauer (USDA-FSIS), Paul Brown (NIH), Linda Detwiler (USDA-APHIS), David W. Harlan (Taylor Byproducts, Inc), and Pedro Piccardo (Indiana University) for their scientific input and critical review of different sections of the manuscript. In addition we would like to thank the following individuals for providing scientific input and support:

John Adams, National Milk Producers Federation; Gary Adams, Texas A&M University; Judd Aiken, University of Wisconsin-Madison; Steve Anderson, USDA-FSIS; Haluk Anil, Bristol University; David Asher, FDA; Harry Baker, Cambridge University; Mike Barry, Oklahoma City Zoo; Robin Bolin, ConAgra Beef Company; David Bolton, New York State Institute for Basic Research; Daniel Bohnenblust, Swiss Federal Statistical Office; Robert Brady, USDA-APHIS; Gerald R. Bratton, Texas A&M University; Robert Brewer, USDA-FSIS; Moira Bruce, Institute for Animal Health, Neuropathogenesis Unit, Edinburgh; Bryan Dierlam, American Cattlemen's Association; Herbert Budka, University of Vienna; Burt Mitchel, FDA; Terry Caviness, Caviness Packing Company; Richard Cawthorne, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, UK; Megna Chakrabarti, Harvard Center for Risk Analysis; Lily Chounlamounry, USDA-FSIS; Nick Chesnut, Union County Feedlot, New Mexico; Christl Donnelly, Oxford University; Nguyen Chau, Harvard Center for Risk Analysis; John Clay, Dairy Records; Michelle Colby, Virginia-Maryland Regional College of Veterinary Medicine; Phillip Comer, DNV; Nancy Cook, Pet Food Institute; Maria Correa, North Carolina State University; Barbara Corso, USDA-APHIS; Randall Cutlip, USDA-Craig White, USDA-FSIS; Ken Crendell, DHI, UTHA; Arthur Davis, USDA, NVSL; Dyan Daly, National Food Center, Dublin; Dave Dargatz, USDA-APHIS; Marcus Doherr, BVET, Switzerland; Basil Eastwood, USDA-CSREES; Dan Englejohn, USDA-FSIS; Lisa Ferguson, USDA-APHIS; Neil Ferguson, Oxford University; J. Fetrow, University of Minnesota; Lloyd Floyd, Kansas Dept. of Wildlife & Parks; Don Franco, National Renderers Association, George Graber, FDA; Azra Ghani, Oxford University; Randy Gordon, National Grain & Feed Association; Daniel Gould, Colorado State University; Temple Grandin, University of Illinois; John Gray, USDA-APHIS; Dicky Griffin, University of Nebraska; Scott Hafner, USDA-APHIS; Rachael Hamilton, American Meat Science Association; Jeff Hansen, Murphy Farm Inc; Michael Hansen, Consumer's Union; David Harbour, Bristol University; Dagmar Heim, BVET, Office Veterinaire Federal, Switzerland; Jud Heinrichs, Penn State University; Christopher Helps, Bristol University; Peter Hewson, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, UK; Harold Hodges, BFD Corporation; Paul Honeyman, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, UK; Will Hueston, Virginia-Maryland Regional College of Veterinary Medicine; Nora Hunter, Institute for Animal Health, Neuropathogenesis Unit, Edinburgh; James Ironside, CJD Surveillance Unit, Edinburgh; J Hamir, USDA-ARS-NADC; Alan Jenny, USDA-APHIS, NVLS; Janice Miller, USDA-ARS, NADC; Jeffrey Martin, VLA Lasswade, Scotland; Mark Hall, USDA-APHIS-NVLS; John Honstead, FDA; Sherri Kochevar, ConAgra Beef Company; Chuck Lambert, American Cattlemen's Beef Association; John Lawrance, University of Iowa Extension Service; T. Lindley, TAMA; Terry Lutz, USDA-AMS; Ernest Justus Lucker, -Liebig University; Donna Malloy, USDA-APHIS; Jeronimo Mamaclay, USDA-FSIS; Danny Matthews, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, UK; Patrick McCaskey, USDA-FSIS; Dan McChesney, FDA; Michael Miller, Colorado Division of Wildlife; Ray Millers, BFD Corporation; Sarah Muirhead, Feedstuff Magazine; Dennis K. Mullane, Taylor By-Products, Inc; H.D. Norman, USDA-ARS; Greg Oliver, Australian Quarantine and Inspection Service; Arnold Paft, USDA-NAH; George

Patrick, Taylor Packing Co. Inc; Alan Perna, United Cooperative Farmers Inc; Jody Pinter, AgSource Cooperative Services; Burt Prichett, FDA; Teresa Platt, Fur Commission USA; Ilpo Pölonen, Finnish Fur Breeders' Association; Jim Quigley, Animal Protein Corporation, Inc; Rosalind Ridley, Cambridge University; Elisa Rubi, Direccion General de Salud Animal, Mexico; R. Rubinstein, NYS Institute for Basic Research in Developmental Disabilities, Staten Island, NY; Larry Satter, USDA-ARS; Glen Schmidt, Colorado State University; Richard Sellers, American Feed Industry Association; Chuck Schuad, University of New Hampshire; Mary Jo Schmerr, USDA-ARS-NADC; Craig Shultz, USDA-FSIS; Bill Smith, USDA-APHIS; L. Smith, National Nutrition Program Advisor, USDA; Charlie Sniffen, Miner Institute; Walt Solonyka, Conagra Beef Company; Robert Somerville, Institute for Animal Health, Neuropathogenesis Unit, Edinburgh; John Spouge, DNV; Richard Theise, International Natural Casing Association; David Thomas, Extension Sheep Specialist, Madison, WI; Judy Thompson, Canadian Food Inspection Agency; Donald Upton, United Cooperative Farmers Inc; Andrea Vicari, North Carolina State University; James Voss, Colorado State University; Paul Walker, Illinois State University; Gary Weber, National Cattlemen's Beef Association; Gerald Wells, Central Veterinary Laboratory, UK; Marion Weybridge, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, UK; John Wilesmith, Central Veterinary Laboratory, UK; Jim Wilkus, USDA-FSIS; Robert Will, CJD Surveillance Unit, Edinburgh; Elizabeth Williams, University of Wyoming; Chris Toyne, Agriculture and Fisheries Branch, ABARE, Australia.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments

Executive Summary

1	Introduction.....	1
2	Background.....	3
2.1	Overview of Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathies (TSEs).....	3
2.1.1	Transmissibility.....	5
2.1.2	The Species Barrier.....	7
2.1.3	Susceptibility.....	8
2.2	The Origin of the BSE Epidemic in the UK.....	13
2.2.1	Scrapie in Sheep.....	13
2.2.2	Infrequent Sporadic BSE.....	15
2.2.3	Toxic Agents and Other Hypotheses.....	16
2.2.3.1	Organophosphate (OP) Pesticides.....	16
2.2.3.2	Copper Deficiency.....	17
2.2.3.3	Heavy Metal Exposure.....	17
2.2.3.4	Autoimmune Disease.....	18
2.2.3.5	Use of Pituitary Hormones.....	18
2.2.3.6	Wild African Antelope.....	19
2.3	Sources of BSE Infectivity.....	19
2.3.1	Spontaneous BSE.....	19
2.3.2	Importation of BSE Infectivity into the United States.....	21
2.3.2.1	Importation of Live Cattle from the UK.....	21
2.3.2.2	Importation of Cattle from Continental Europe.....	21
2.3.2.3	Importation of Cattle from Non-European Countries.....	22
2.3.2.4	Imported MBM and Feed.....	22
2.3.3	Domestic Scrapie.....	23
2.3.4	Chronic Wasting Disease: Oral Exposure.....	24
2.3.5	Chronic Wasting Disease: Lateral Transmission.....	26
2.3.6	Mink.....	26
2.3.7	Pigs.....	27
2.3.7.1	Potential Infectivity in Pigs due to TSE Infection.....	28
2.3.7.2	Potential Infectivity in Materials Consumed by Pigs.....	30
2.3.8	Poultry.....	31
2.3.9	Recycled Products.....	31
2.3.9.1	Plate Waste.....	32
2.3.9.2	Gelatin.....	33
2.3.9.3	Milk.....	33
2.3.9.4	Blood and blood products.....	34
2.3.9.5	Tallow.....	34
2.4	Measures Taken to Protect Against BSE.....	34
2.4.1	General Issues Related to the Surveillance of BSE and the Deactivation of the BSE Agent.....	35
2.4.2	Actions to Address BSE in the UK.....	37
2.4.3	Actions to Address BSE in Europe.....	39
2.4.4	Measures to Prevent the Establishment of BSE in the United States Cattle Population.....	41
2.4.5	BSE Surveillance in the United States.....	44
3	Methodology.....	46
3.1	Simulation Model and Base Case Assumptions.....	46
3.1.1	Cattle Population Dynamics.....	47

3.1.1.1	Size of Cattle Population, Birth Rates, Slaughter Rates, and Rates of Death due to Other Causes	48
3.1.1.2	Cattle Consumption of Bypass protein and Blood Meal	49
3.1.1.3	BSE Dose-Response	50
3.1.1.4	Maternal Transmission	50
3.1.1.5	The BSE Incubation Period, and Time Until Death Caused by BSE	51
3.1.2	The Slaughter Process	51
3.1.2.1	Level of Infectivity and Distribution of Infectivity Throughout the Carcass	51
3.1.2.2	<i>Antemortem</i> Inspection	54
3.1.2.3	Stunning	55
3.1.2.4	Exsanguination	56
3.1.2.5	Disposition of Brain	56
3.1.2.6	Splitting and Aerosolization	56
3.1.2.7	Disposition of the Spinal Cord and Dorsal Root Ganglia	57
3.1.2.8	Postmortem Inspection	59
3.1.2.9	Processing	60
3.1.3	Rendering and Feed Production	60
3.1.3.1	Rendering Inactivation	61
3.1.3.2	Meat and Bone Meal Production	61
3.1.3.3	Feed Production	62
3.1.3.4	On Farm Feeding	64
3.1.4	Potential Human Exposure	65
3.2	Impact of Alternative Assumptions on Cattle Infected and Human BSE Exposure	67
3.2.1	Maternal BSE transmission Assumptions	68
3.2.2	Slaughter Process Assumptions	68
3.2.3	Render and Feed Production Process Assumptions	69
3.2.4	Proportion of Tissues Recovered for Human Consumption	70
3.2.5	Proportion of Animals That Die on Farm that Are Rendered	70
3.2.6	The Possibility That BSE-Infected Cattle Carry Infectivity in Their Blood	70
3.2.7	The Possibility that Humans are Exposed to BSE Infectivity in Trigeminal Ganglia	71
3.3	The Base Case: Impact of Alternative Sources of Infectivity	71
3.3.1	Spontaneous BSE	71
3.3.2	Importation of Infected Cattle	73
3.3.3	Domestic Scrapie	74
3.3.4	Chronic Wasting Disease: Oral Exposure	75
3.3.5	Chronic Wasting Disease: Lateral Transmission	77
3.3.6	Mink	77
3.3.7	Pigs	79
3.3.8	Poultry	79
3.3.9	Recycled Waste	79
3.4	Alternative Scenarios Evaluated Using the Simulation Model	79
3.4.1	Switzerland	79
3.4.2	Spontaneous Disease as a Potential Source of Infectivity in the U.S.	82
3.4.3	Cattle Imported into the U.S. from the UK During the 1980s	82
3.4.4	Risk Management: Specified Risk Materials (SRM) Ban	83
3.4.5	Risk Management: A Ban on Rendering Animals that Die on the Farm	84
4	Results	85
4.1	Base Case	86
4.2	Sensitivity Analyses and Alternative Assumptions	87
4.2.1	Sensitivity Analysis	88
4.2.2	Inherent Infectivity in Blood	89
4.2.3	Harvesting of Trigeminal Ganglia	89
4.3	Alternative Sources of Infectivity	89
4.3.1	Spontaneous	90
4.3.2	Imports	90

4.3.3	Scrapie	91
4.4	Alternative Scenarios	92
4.4.1	Switzerland	92
4.4.2	Spontaneous With no Feed Ban	93
4.4.3	Cattle Imported from the UK in the 1980s.....	94
4.4.4	Specified Risk Material Ban	96
4.4.5	Prohibition on Rendering Animals that Die on the Farm.....	96
4.5	Summary.....	97
References:		101

Figures

Appendix 1: Base Case Assumptions

Appendix 2: Assumptions for Simulations Other than the Base Case

Appendix 3A: Results – Tables

Appendix 3B: Results – Figures

Appendix 3C: Description of Model Output Tables and Graphs